# A high-throughput screen of cell-death-inducing factors in *Nicotiana benthamiana* identifies a novel MAPKK that mediates INF1-induced cell death signaling and non-host resistance to *Pseudomonas cichorii*

Yoshihiro Takahashi<sup>1,†</sup>, Khairun Hisam Bin Nasir<sup>1,2,†</sup>, Akiko Ito<sup>1</sup>, Hiroyuki Kanzaki<sup>1</sup>, Hideo Matsumura<sup>1</sup>, Hiromasa Saitoh<sup>1</sup>, Shizuko Fujisawa<sup>1</sup>, Sophien Kamoun<sup>3</sup> and Ryohei Terauchi<sup>1,\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Iwate Biotechnology Research Center, 22-174-4, Narita, Kitakami, Iwate 024-0003, Japan,

<sup>2</sup>The United Graduate School of Agricultural Sciences, Iwate University, 3-18-8, Ueda, Morioka, Iwate 020-8550, Japan, and <sup>3</sup>Department of Plant Pathology, Ohio State University, Ohio Agricultural Research and Development Center, Wooster, OH 44691, USA

Received 15 June 2006; revised 6 November 2006; accepted 7 November 2006. \*For correspondence (fax +81 197 68 2911; e-mail terauchi@ibrc.or.jp). \*The first two authors contributed equally to this work.

#### Summary

A high-throughput overexpression screen of *Nicotiana benthamiana* cDNAs identified a gene for a mitogenactivated protein kinase kinase (MAPKK) as a potent inducer of the hypersensitive response (HR)-like cell death. NbMKK1 protein is localized to the nucleus, and the N-terminal putative MAPK docking site of NbMKK1 is required for its function as a cell-death inducer. *NbMKK1*-mediated leaf-cell death was compromised in leaves where *NbSIPK* expression was silenced by virus-induced gene silencing. A yeast two-hybrid assay showed that NbMKK1 and NbSIPK physically interact, suggesting that NbSIPK is one of the downstream targets of NbMKK1. *Phytophthora infestans* INF1 elicitor-mediated HR was delayed in *NbMKK1*-silenced plants, indicating that NbMKK1 is involved in this HR pathway. Furthermore, the resistance of *N. benthamiana* to a non-host pathogen *Pseudomonas cichorii* was compromised in *NbMKK1*-silenced plants. These results demonstrate that MAPK cascades involving NbMKK1 control non-host resistance including HR cell death.

Keywords: mitogen-activated protein kinase kinase, cell death, phytophthora infestans, nuclear localization, virus-induced gene silencing, non-host resistance.

## Introduction

Programmed cell death is an essential physiological process occurring during plant development and in response to biotic and abiotic stress (Beers and McDowell, 2001). Defense mechanisms of plants against invading pathogens often include localized cell death, known as the hypersensitive response (HR). This process shares numerous characteristics with mammalian apoptosis (Lam *et al.*, 2001), and requires active transcription and translation (Greenberg, 1997). The activation of defense responses is initiated upon plant-pathogen recognition, mediated either by a genefor-gene interaction between a plant resistance (*R*) gene and a pathogen avirulence (*Avr*) gene, or by the binding of a nonrace-specific elicitor to the receptor (Baker *et al.*, 1997; Dangl and Jones, 2001; Hammond-Kosack and Jones, 1996; Martin, 1999). Extensive research on the signaling cascade leading to HR downstream of *R*-gene mediated pathogen recognition led to the identification of various genes required for *R*-gene-mediated HR, such as *Rar1* (Shirasu *et al.*, 1999), *Sgt1* (Austin *et al.*, 2002; Azevedo *et al.*, 2002; Liu *et al.*, 2002b; Peart *et al.*, 2002), *Hsp90* (Hubert *et al.*, 2003; Liu *et al.*, 2004a; Lu *et al.*, 2004; Takahashi *et al.*, 2003a,b), *Ndr1* (Century *et al.*, 1995) and *Eds1* (Liu *et al.*, 2002a; Parker *et al.*, 1996). However, the information on the whole signaling network is still fragmentary, and many more important players involved in HR remain to be discovered.

In a previous study, we performed high-throughput overexpression screening of a plant cDNA library, and identified several genes that cause cell death in *Nicotiana benthamiana* leaves upon overexpression, including a gene for the class-II ethylene-responsive element binding factor (ERF) (Nasir *et al.*, 2005). Here, we report on another cDNA identified in the screen, which codes for a novel mitogenactivated protein kinase kinase (MAPKK), a component of MAPK cascade.

The post-translational modification of proteins such as phosphorylation and de-phosphorylation plays an important role in cellular signaling. The MAPK cascade is one of the major pathways by which extracellular stimuli are transduced into intracellular responses in eukaryotic cells via the phosphorylation/dephosphorylation of signaling proteins (Davis, 2000; Herskowitz, 1995; Widmann et al., 1999). MAPK cascades are composed of three sequentially acting kinase components, MAPKK kinase (MAPKKK), MAPKK and MAPK. MAPKs are activated via the dual phosphorylation of their Thr and Tyr residues within a TXY motif by MAPKKs as the upstream kinases, which, in turn, are activated by MAPKKKs. The most extensively characterized plant MAPKs are the tobacco salicylic-acid-induced protein kinase (SIPK; Zhang and Klessig, 1997) and the wound-induced protein kinase (WIPK; Seo et al., 1995, 1999), and their orthologs in other plant species (Lee et al., 2004; Pedlev and Martin, 2005; Romeis, 2001; Zhang and Klessig, 2001). Both SIPK and WIPK are activated in a gene-for-gene-specific manner either in N gene-harboring tobacco plants exhibiting resistance to tobacco mosaic virus (TMV; Zhang and Klessig, 1998) or in Cf9-expressing tobacco responding to the Cladosporium fulvum-encoded elicitor Avr9 (Romeis et al., 1999). A tobacco MAPKK NtMEK2 acts upstream of both SIPK and WIPK in pathways that lead to host cell death (Yang et al., 2001). SIPK overexpression alone also resulted in host cell death and transcriptional activation of defense-related genes (Zhang and Liu, 2001). Moreover, gene silencing of NtMEK2 compromised R gene-mediated resistance to viral pathogens (Jin et al., 2003), and gene silencing of either SIPK or WIPK abrogated the defense of plants against a bacterial pathogen (Sharma et al., 2003). Recently, del Pozo et al. (2004) identified a tomato MAPKKK, MAPKKKa, as a positive regulator of cell death associated with both plant immunity and disease. MAPKKKa gene silencing abrogated the HR-like cell death caused by the interaction between Pseudomonas syringae avirulence gene AvrPto and its cognate R gene Pto. MAPKKKa overexpression combined with the virus-induced gene silencing (VIGS) of various MAPKK annd MAPK genes showed that two MAPK cascades, MEK2  $\rightarrow$  SIPK and MEK1  $\rightarrow$  NTF6, are downstream components transducing the cell-death signals from MAPKKKa. Liu et al. (2004b)) showed that two MAPK cascades, MEK2  $\rightarrow$  SIPK/WIPK and MEK1/NQK1  $\rightarrow$  NTF6/ NRK1, participate in the N-gene mediated resistance of N. benthamiana against TMV. Plants have more than 100 genes that encode MAPK-related proteins, yet relatively little is known about their function and contribution to different pathways. In the present study we first demonstrate that NbMKK1 is a positive regulator of cell death, and by employing the VIGS approach we show that NbMKK1 is involved in the regulation of the *Phytophthora infestans* INF1 elicitor-induced HR cell death and non-host resistance of *N. benthamiana* against *Pseudomonas cichorii*.

## Results

#### Overexpression of NbMKK1 caused cell death

We performed a high-throughput in planta overexpression screening of 40 000 N. benthamiana cDNAs using the potato virus X (PVX) system, and identified several cDNAs, including NbCD1 coding for a class-II ERF, that caused cell death upon overexpression (Nasir et al., 2005). The DNA sequence of one such cDNA had a high similarity to MAPKK genes, and we named it NbMKK1 (GenBank Accession No. AB243987). The predicted protein for NbMKK1 is composed of 325 amino acids, and phylogenetic analysis classified NbMKK1 into the subfamily D of plant MAPKK (Ichimura et al., 2002; Figure 1). The most closely related protein is LeMKK4 from tomato (Pedlev and Martin, 2004; 87% amino acid sequence similarity). The amino acid sequence similarity of NbMKK1 to the well-studied MAPKKs was low: 27.4% similarity to NtMEK2 (belonging to subfamily C) and 30.1% similarity to NtMEK1 (subfamily A). NbMKK1 has putative phosphorylation sites (T209 and S215) and an invariant ATP binding site (K88) conserved in all MAPKKs.

Overexpression of *NbMKK1* resulted in a strong phenotype, causing cell death on *N. benthamiana* leaves 2 weeks after toothpick inoculation and 4 days after infiltration of *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* harboring *NbMKK1* in the pSfinx vector (Takken *et al.*, 2000; Figure 2). Next, we confirmed the correlation between the NbMKK1 protein production and cell death by employing the glucocorticoid-inducible expres-



Figure 1. Phylogenetic tree of plant mitogen-activated protein kinase kinase (MAPKK) including *Nicotiana benthamiana* NbMKK1.

Relationships of the four groups of MAPKK (Groups A–D) are shown. Detailed phylogeny is given for MAPKKs in Group D. The species of origin of the MAPKKs are indicated by the abbreviation in front of the protein names; At, *Arabidopsis thaliana*; Le, *Lycopersicon esculentum*; Nt, *Nicotiana tobacum*.



Figure 2. Cell-death phenotype in *Nicotiana benthamiana* leaves caused by *NbMKK1* overexpression.

*Agrobacterium tumefaciens* cells harboring either an empty pSfinx vector (left) or pSfinx-*NbMKK1* (right) were inoculated to *N. benthamiana* leaves either by toothpicks (top) or infiltrated into the right half of the leaf with a needleless syringe (bottom). Phenotypes of leaves 2 weeks post-inoculation (top) and 4 days post-agroinfiltration (bottom) are shown.

sion system GVG (Aoyama and Chua, 1997). Complementary DNA inserted into the GVG vector was modified so that the N-terminus of the protein was tagged with a triple c-myc epitope, resulting in c-myc-NbMKK1. A. tumefaciens harboring c-myc-NbMKK1 was infiltrated into N. benthamiana leaves by a needle-less syringe to establish the transient transformation of the leaves. Two days later, the glucocorticoid inducer dexamethasone (DEX) was infiltrated to induce c-myc-NbMKK1 expression. Production of c-myc-NbMKK1 protein was confirmed by western analysis using an anti-c-myc antibody. As shown in Figure 3(a), strong expression of c-myc-NbMKK1 protein became detectable 4 h after DEX treatment, and the protein was abundantly produced for up to 24 h. Leaf-cell death was clearly observed 48 h after DEX treatment (Figure 3b). This result demonstrates that the cell death is caused by the overproduction of NbMKK1.

To study whether kinase activity of NbMKK1 is necessary for causing cell death, a kinase-dead mutant of NbMKK1 was made by changing the amino acid K88 (lysine), required for ATP binding, into R (arginine), resulting in c-mvc-NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup>. The GVG vector-mediated inducible expression of c-myc-NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> did not cause leaf cell death even after 48 h of DEX treatment (Figure 3b), whereas the c-myc-NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> protein was abundantly expressed (Figure 3a). Furthermore, to confirm the link between NbMKK1 kinase activity and cell death, the autophosphorylation activity of NbMKK1 was tested in vitro using recombinant NbMKK1 and NbMKK1KR. As expected NbMKK1 phosphorylated itself, whereas NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> did not (Figure 3c). These results clearly show that kinase activity of NbMKK1 is necessary to cause cell death in N. benthamiana. NbMKK1 has an N-terminal RERROLNLRLPL sequence corresponding to the



Figure 3. Protein expression, cell-death phenotype and autophosphorylation of NbMKK1 and NbMKK1<sup>RR</sup>.

(a) Western blot analysis of NbMKK1 and NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> protein. NbMKK1 and its mutant construct NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> were transiently transformed into *Nicotiana benthamiana* leaves. Two days later, transgene expression was induced by the application of dexamethasone (DEX, 30 μM) and the expressed proteins were detected by c-myc-antibody.

(b) NbMKK1 caused cell death (left half of the leaf), but the kinase-dead mutant, NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup>, did not (right half of the leaf). Pictures were taken 48 h after DEX treatment.

(c) NbMKK1 autophosphorylates, but the mutant NbMKK1  $^{\rm KR}$  does not.

(d) Cell death caused by NbMKK1 lacking an N-terminal docking site (NbMKK1<sup> $\Delta$ </sup>, right) is delayed compared with that caused by the wild-type NbMKK1 (middle).

known MAPK docking site sequence (Ichimura *et al.*, 2002) that consists of a cluster of basic amino acid residues N-terminal to hydrophobic residues. The basic amino acid residues are supposed to interact electrostatically with acidic amino acid residues in the common docking domain of MAPKs (Tanoue *et al.*, 2000). To determine whether the MAPK docking site is important for the function of NbMKK1 in the plant, we deleted the N-terminal 40 amino acids residues from NbMKK1 (resulting in NbMKK1<sup>Δ</sup>) and expressed it in *N. benthamiana* leaves. As shown in Figure 3(d), the cell death induced by NbMKK1<sup>Δ</sup> was much delayed compared with the cell death induced by NbMKK1. This result indicates that the N-terminal putative MAPK docking site of NbMKK1 is essential for the function of NbMKK1 as a rapid cell-death inducer.

# H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> generation caused by NbMKK1 overexpression

We studied early cellular events leading to leaf cell death triggered by the expression of NbMKK1. In DEX-treated NbMKK1-transformed leaves,  $H_2O_2$  generation started at



Figure 4. . NbMKK1 overexpression and  $H_2O_2$  generation. Hydrogen peroxide generation in either NbMKK1 (black bar) or NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> (white bar) overexpressing leaves. Data presented are the mean values of three independent experiments and error bars represent the standard

4–8 h and continued until 24 h after the treatment (Figure 4), exactly corresponding to the timing of the c-myc-NbMKK1 protein accumulation in the leaf (Figure 3a). This  $H_2O_2$  production is specifically induced by NbMKK1 kinase activity, as no  $H_2O_2$  burst was observed in *NbMKK1*<sup>KR</sup>-transformed leaves.

# NbMKK1 is localized to the nucleus

deviation (DEX, dexamethasone),

To examine the subcellular localization of NbMKK1, jellyfish GFP cDNA was fused in frame to the 5'-end of NbMKK1 cDNA, and subsequently cloned in the GVG vector to generate GVG-GFP-NbMKK1. After expression of GFP-NbMKK1 in *N. benthamiana* cells GFP fluorescence was consistently observed in the nuclei, suggesting that NbMKK1 is localized to the nucleus (Figure 5a,b). This was confirmed by the fact that GFP-NbMKK1 localization exactly corresponded to the region stained by the DNA-specific stain 4'-6-Diamidino-2-phenylindole (DAPI) (Figure 5c). Moreover cell death was observed in GFP-NbMKK1-expressing leaves 48 h after DEX treatment (Figure 5b), suggesting that NbMKK1 may function in the nuclei to cause cell death.

### NbSIPK acts downstream of NbMKK1 to trigger cell death

So far, intensive studies have been carried out to elucidate the roles of the two tobacco MAPKs, SIPK and WIPK, in plant-defense signaling (Romeis *et al.*, 1999; Seo *et al.*, 1995; Zhang and Klessig, 1998). In order to test whether NbSIPK and/or NbWIPK are downstream targets of NbMKK1, we first carried out an in-gel kinase assay with myeline basic protein (MBP) as substrate using leaves in which either NbMKK1 or NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> was overexpressed. It is known that MBP is a suitable substrate of SIPK and WIPK (Romeis *et al.*, 1999; Sharma *et al.*, 2003). The in-gel kinase assay showed that NbMKK1, but not NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup>, overexpression strongly acti-



Figure 5. Localization of NbMKK1 in the nucleus.

(a) GFP-NbMKK1 localization in an epidermal cell observed with a fluorescence microscope.

(b) GFP-derived-fluorescence (left) and differential interference contrast (middle) images of protoplasts. Leaf phenotypes 48 h after dexamethasone (DEX) treatment are shown (right). GFP and GFP-NbMKK1 constructs in the pTA7001 vector were transiently transformed into *Nicotiana benthamiana* leaves. Twelve hours after DEX treatment, protoplasts were isolated and pictures were taken.

(c) Localization of GFP (left), nuclei stained by 4'-6-Diamidino-2-phenylindole (DAPI) (middle) and differential interference contrast (right) of a protoplast overexpressing GFP-NbMKK1.

vated a 48-kDa kinase (Figure 6a). The sizes of SIPK and WIPK are known to be 48 and 46 kDa, respectively, so that we hypothesized that NbMKK1 activates NbSIPK.

Next, we designed an 'epistasis' experiment whereby the overexpression of *NbMKK1* was combined with VIGS of either *NbSIPK* or *NbWIPK*. The assumption is that the NbMKK1-mediated cell death would be compromised if the expression of a key downstream MAPK component was suppressed. As shown in Figure 6(b,c), the NbMKK1-mediated cell death is remarkably delayed in the *NbSIPK*-silenced plant, as compared with control, suggesting that NbSIPK is the MAPK transducing cell-death signal downstream of



#### Figure 6. NbSIPK functions downstream of NbMKK1

(a) Myeline basic protein (MBP) in-gel kinase assay of leaves in which either NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> or NbMKK1 was overexpressed.

(b) NbMKK1-mediated cell death is delayed in *NbSIPK*-silenced plants. Overexpression of *NbMKK1* in *Nicotiana benthamiana* leaves where either the *NbSIPK* or the *NbWIPK* gene was silenced by virus induced gene silencing (VIGS). A potato virus X (PVX)-*GFP*-inoculated plant was used as a negative control. Pictures were taken 48 h after dexamethasone (DEX) treatment. The experiments were repeated three times with the same result.

(c) Confirmation of gene silencing of *NbSIPK* and *NbWIPK*. RT-PCR of *NbSIPK*, *NbWIPK* and *rbcS* genes in PVX-*GFP*, PVX-*NbSIPK* and PVX-*NbWIPK*-inoculated plants.

(d) NbMKK1 phosphorylates NbSIPK. Phosphorylation activities of *His*-NbMKK1 and *His*-NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> were determined by using the inactive mutant *His*-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> as a substrate. Reaction in the absence (–) of mitogen-activated protein kinase kinase (MAPKK) was used as the control. The radioactivity of *His*-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> was visualized by autoradiography following SDS-PAGE.

(e) NbMKK1 and NbSIPK interacted in yeast. A yeast two-hybrid assay was carried out using NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> as bait and NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> as prey. MKK1<sup>KR</sup>-pGBK17 and pGADT7-SIPK<sup>KR</sup> prey-bait combinations are negative controls and the T-p53 combination is a positive control.

(f) Salicylic-acid-induced protein kinase (SIPK)-GFP localization. SIPK-GFP was expressed either alone (left) or with NbMKK1 (right). SIPK-GFP was invariably localized both in the cytoplasm and the nuclei, irrespective of either the absence or the presence of NbMKK1.

NbMKK1. On the other hand, NbMKK1-mediated cell death did not alter in *NbWIPK*-silenced plants.

To test whether NbMKK1 is able to phosphorylate NbSIPK, an inactive His-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> protein was used as a substrate. As His-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> lacks autophosphorylation activity, it is an ideal substrate for assaying upstream MAPKK activities (Yang *et al.*, 2001). As shown in Figure 6(d), NbMKK1 phosphorylated His-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup>, whereas NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> did not.

These data suggest the presence of an NbMKK1-NbSIPK signaling pathway. To see whether these proteins physically interact, a yeast two-hybrid assay was carried out using NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> as bait and NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> as prey (Figure 6e). Both NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> and NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> are catalytically inactive, so they were expected not to interfere with yeast cellular signaling pathways. It is also thought that transient interaction can be stabilized by using inactive proteins (see Tanoue et al., 1999). These two proteins indeed physically interacted in yeast. Taken together, in vivo and in vitro results demonstrate that NbMKK1 is an upstream kinase for NbSIPK, and that the NbMKK1  $\rightarrow$  NbSIPK cascade controls the observed HR-like cell death. To see the subcellular localization of NbSIPK NbSIPK-GFP fusion protein was overexpressed in N. benthamiana leaves, and its localization was observed in either the absence or the presence of NbMKK1 overexpression. NbSIPK-GFP was invariably localized both in the cytoplasm and the nuclei, and no change in its localization was observed as a result of the presence/absence of NbMKK1 (Figure 6f).

# VIGS of NbMKK1 suppresses INF1-elicitor-mediated cell death

*NbMKK1* exhibited a high basal expression, as studied by northern-blot analysis, and its expression did not show remarkable change by either treatments with *P. infestans* INF1 elicitin (Kamoun *et al.*, 1998) or inoculation of a nonhost pathogen, *P. cichorii* (data not shown).

To evaluate the function of NbMKK1 in plant defense, NbMKK1 expression was silenced by VIGS using PVX. A partial fragment of NbMKK1 cDNA was cloned into PVX vector (pPC2S; Baulcombe et al., 1995) in the anti-sense orientation, and RNA transcribed from this vector was inoculated to N. benthamiana leaves. The specificity of the NbMKK1 partial fragment was tested by Southern analysis (Figure 7a). When used as a probe this fragment detected only one band in the N. benthamiana genomic DNA digested with HindIII, indicating that our VIGS is specific to NbMKK1. Twenty-one days after virus inoculation, gene silencing of NbMKK1 in the 3-4 leaves above the inoculated leaf was confirmed by RT-PCR (Figure 7b). The overall appearance of NbMKK1-silenced plants was the same as the wild-type plants. To examine the response of NbMKK1silenced plants to a pathogen HR elicitor, P. infestans INF1 elicitin (Kamoun et al., 1998), which triggers the HR in N. benthamiana, was infiltrated to the leaves of NbMKK1-



Figure 7. VIGS of *NbMKK1* delayed *Phytophthora infestans* (INF1)-mediated hypersensitive response (HR) development and attenuated resistance against a non-host pathogen *Pseudomonas cichorii*.

(a) Southern blot analysis of the NbMKK1 insert fragment used for VIGS. A single band was detected in the *Nicotiana benthamiana* genomic DNA digested with *Hin*dIII.

(b) RT-PCR of *NbMKK1* and *rbcS* genes in potato virus X (PVX)-*GFP*-infected and PVX-*NbMKK1*-infected plants.

(c) The HR caused by the INF1 elicitor was delayed in the *NbMKK1*-silenced plant (PVX-*NbMKK1*) compared with the PVX-*GFP* control. Pictures were taken 24 h after INF1 infiltration. The experiments were repeated three times with reproducible results.

(d) NbMKK1 gene silencing attenuated resistance against a non-host pathogen *P. cichorii.* White bars: control plants infected with PVX::GFP. Black bars: plants infected with PVX::NbMKK1. The vertical axis indicates the titer of *P. cichorii* in *N. benthamiana* leaves.

silenced and control plants. The timing of INF1-mediated cell death was consistently delayed in *NbMKK1*-silenced plants compared with control plants (Figure 7c). Twenty-four hours after INF1 treatment HR-like cell death was obvious in the control plants, whereas either no or only slight cell death was visible in *NbMKK1*-silenced plants. Forty hours after INF1 treatment both the control and *NbMKK1*-silenced plants developed similar levels of HR-like cell death (data not shown). The same results were obtained in three independent experiments.

To evaluate the role of NbMKK1 in host resistance against pathogens, we inoculated a non-host pathogen *P. cichorii* (Sharma *et al.*, 2003) to *N. benthamiana* plants whereby *NbMKK1* expression was silenced by VIGS. The *NbMKK1*silenced plant allowed a higher growth of *P. cichorii* compared with the control 36 h after the inoculation (Figure 7d). The same results were obtained in three independent experiments. This result shows that a signaling pathway involving NbMKK1 is necessary for the full resistance of *N. benthamiana* against *P. cichorii*.

#### Discussion

We performed a high-throughput screen of cell-death-causing factors in *N. benthaminana*, and identified NbMKK1 as a key regulator of cell death associated with plant immunity. NbMKK1 overexpression resulted in the accumulation of the protein to nuclei and rapid cell death, confirming a positive role for NbMKK1 in cell-death regulation. Cell death caused by NbMKK1 overexpression was associated with the rapid generation of  $H_2O_2$ , displaying a similarity to pathogen-induced HR. Most importantly, the NbMKK1 loss-of-function study demonstrated that NbMKK1 is involved in the regulation of the HR caused by *P. infestans* elicitor INF1 and resistance against a non-host pathogen, *P. cichorii*.

#### NbMKK1 and MAPK cascades

The Arabidopsis genome encodes approximately 60 MAP-KKKs, 10 MAPKKs and 20 MAPKs (Ichimura et al., 2002). To date, functions of only a few complete plant MAPK cascades have been elucidated. An Arabidopsis cascade involving AtMEKK1, AtMKK4/5 and AtMPK3/6 functions downstream of FLS2 receptor-mediated flagellin perception and innate immunity (Asai et al., 2002). The tomato LeMAPKKKa, LeMKK2 and LeMPK1/2/3 cascade transduces Pto resistance gene-mediated immunity (del Pozo et al., 2004). Plant MAPKKs are classified to four groups, Groups A, B, C and D (Ichimura et al., 2002), and sequence comparison placed NbMKK1 within Group D (Figure 1), Functions of several individual plant MAPKKs are known. The tobacco NtMEK1 of Group A is known to be involved in cell division and plant defense (Calderini et al., 2001; Liu et al., 2004b). Alfalfa PRKK is also classified in Group A and transmits an elicitor signal to downstream MAPKs (Cardinale et al., 2002). Arabidopsis MKK3 and tobacco NPK2 of Group B mediate the nuclear transport of RAN-GDP (Quimby et al., 2000). Tobacco NtMEK2 in Group C was found to be an upstream kinase of two plant MAPKs, SIPK and WIPK (Yang et al., 2001). Overexpression of constitutively active NtMEK2 caused cell death (Yang et al., 2001), and a VIGS study of NtMEK2 indicated that NtMEK2 is involved in TMV resistance (Jin et al., 2003). Arabidopsis AtMKK4 and AtMKK5, the orthologs of NtMEK2, showed similar effects as those observed with NtMEK2 (Ren et al., 2002). However, until the report by Pedley and Martin (2004) there was no single report on the function of MAPKK belonging to Group D. Pedley and Martin (2004) showed that a tomato MAPKK, LeMKK4, causes cell death upon overexpression. Furthermore, they showed by an in vitro experiment that LeMKK4 activates downstream MAPKs, LeMPK2 (similar to tobacco SIPK) and LeMPK3 (similar to tobacco WIPK). Sequence analysis of NbMKK1 showed that NbMKK1 shared 87% amino acid homology to LeMKK4, suggesting that it is an ortholog of LeMKK4 in terms of sequence similarity and function.

We demonstrated that NbMKK1 is an upstream kinase of NbSIPK *in vivo* by a VIGS study (Figure 6b) as well as by *in vitro* studies (Figure 6d,e). This implies that there are at least two signal transduction pathways leading to SIPK activation: the NtMEK2-SIPK pathway (Yang *et al.*, 2001) and the NbMKK1-SIPK pathway (the present study). As SIPK overexpression also caused HR-like cell death (Zhang and Liu, 2001), it is highly probable that NbMKK1-mediated cell

death, as observed in the present study, was driven by the activation of NbSIPK. SIPK is activated rapidly in response to a variety of biotic and abiotic stresses including osmotic and salt stress, wounding, virus infection and treatment with non-race-specific elicitors from fungi and bacteria (Hoyos and Zhang, 2000; Lee *et al.*, 2001; Mikolajczyk *et al.*, 2000; Zhang and Klessig, 1998). Together, these data indicate that SIPK may be a convergence point for many different stress signal transduction pathways.

## Nuclear localization of NbMKK1

Elucidating the subcellular localization of MAPK pathway components is a key to understanding how the specificity of signaling is maintained and the way in which signaling is further propagated (Cyert, 2001). MAPK and MAPKK localization has been studied considerably in mammalian and yeast systems under various conditions, and it was found that they change localization depending on cellular conditions (Chen et al., 1992; Ferrigno et al., 1998; Jaaro et al., 1997: Lenormand et al., 1998). The best studied localization of MAPK signaling cascades is that of the human extracellular signal-regulated kinase (ERK)1/2 cascade composed of ERK1/2 (MAPK), MEK1/2 (MAPKK) and Raf1 (MAPKKK) (Kondoh et al., 2005; Pouyssegur et al., 2002). A cytosolic localization of Raf1, MEK1/2 and ERK1/2 was demonstrated in quiescent cells. However, stimulation of cells caused a rapid translocation of Raf1 to the plasma membrane and the translocation of MEK1/2 and ERK1/2 to the nuclei. Whereas ERK1/2 is retained in the nucleus, MEK1 and 2 are rapidly transported back to the cytoplasm as a result of their nuclear export signal (Fukuda et al., 1997; Jaaro et al., 1997). Therefore, MAPKKs have generally been considered to be located in the cytoplasm most of the time. However, Raviv et al. (2004) recently reported that human MEK5, as well as its downstream MAPK, ERK5, are always localized to the nucleus irrespective of cellular conditions. In this case, the upstream MAPKKK, MEKK2, is shuttling between cytoplasm and nuclei. The nuclear localization of human MEK5 is similar to that of NbMKK1 in the present study. In plants, subcellular localization of MAPK components has been studied in several cases (Ahlfors et al., 2004; Bögre et al., 1999; Calderini et al., 1998; Lee et al., 2004; Ligterink et al., 1997). Two Arabidopsis MAPKs, AtMPK3 and AtMPK6, were shown to translocate from the cytoplasm to the nuclei after ozone treatment (Ahlfors et al., 2004). Similarly, in parsley cells two MAPKs, PcMPK3 and PcMPK6, translocate to nuclei following phytophthora-derived (Pep-13) elicitor treatment (Lee et al., 2004). However, the upstream MAPKK of PcMPK3 and PcMPK6, PcMKK5, was retained in the cytoplasm after the stimulus. This observed localization of plant MAPK components is in accord with the pattern observed in human ERK1/2 localization. In this regard, nuclear localization of NbMKK1 is unique as it is always retained in the nucleus. However, no

obvious nuclear localizing signal (NLS) was found in the NbMKK1 amino acid sequence. The mechanisms of nuclear localization of NbMKK1, and the regulation of its interaction with NbSIPK, should be addressed in future work.

# NbMKK1 functions in INF1-mediated HR-like cell death and non-host resistance against P. cichorii

Phytophthora infestans INF1 elicitor-mediated HR-like cell death was remarkably delayed in NbMKK1-silenced N. benthamiana plants (Figure 7c). Furthermore, non-host resistance of N. benthamiana against a bacterial pathogen P. cichorii was attenuated in NbMKK1-silenced plants (Figure 7d). These loss-of-function results show that signals of INF1-induced cell death and non-host resistance against P. cichorii are transduced via a cascade involving NbMKK1. As overexpression of NbMKK1 caused HR-like cell death, whereas gene silencing of NbMKK1 attenuated HR and non-host resistance, we conclude that NbMKK1 is an important component of non-host resistance-related signaling, However, as INF1-mediated HR-like cell death was not totally abrogated in NbMKK1-silenced plants, there should be at least one more pathway downstream of INF1 leading to cell death. Possible candidates include the pathway involving NtMEK2 (Yang et al., 2001) and those involving CDPK (Romeis et al., 2001). In a previous study we showed that INF1-mediated HR was not affected by the gene silencing of SIPK and WIPK, and hypothesized that these two MAPKs are not major components in INF1 cell-death signal transduction (Sharma et al., 2003). On the basis of the present study and that of Sharma et al. (2003), we predict that there is another unidentified MAPK other than SIPK/WIPK downstream of NbMKK1 that is involved in INF1 cell-death signaling. These target MAPKs and upstream MAPKKK of NbMKK1 should be identified in future studies.

# **Experimental procedures**

## Plant material and INF1 treatment

*Nicotiana benthamiana* plants were grown in a glasshouse at  $23^{\circ}$ C. INF1 elicitor (100 nm) was prepared according to Kamoun *et al.* (1998) and infiltrated to well-developed leaf blades. Leaves were collected at 0, 15, 30, 60, 120 and 240 min after infiltration and subsequently employed for isolation of RNA for cDNA library construction.

# cDNA library construction in pSfinx vector and screening of cell-death-inducing factors

The cDNA library construction and the screening of cell-deathinducing factors by toothpick inoculation of *A. tumefaciens* clones was reported previously (Nasir *et al.*, 2005). Briefly, mRNA was isolated from total RNA by the use of an mRNA purification kit<sup>TM</sup> (Amersham Biosciences, http://www.amersham.com/), followed by the synthesis of double-stranded cDNAs with the SuperScript Plasmid System<sup>TM</sup> (Invitrogen, http://www.invitrogen.com/). These cDNAs, with *Sall* sites in the 5'-ends and *Notl* sites in the 3'-ends, were directionally cloned into a modified pSfinx vector (Takken *et al.*, 2000). The pSfinx library was transformed into *A. tumefaciens* strain MOG101 cells by electroporation. Cultured *A. tumefaciens* cells were lifted by toothpicks, and inoculated to *N. benthamiana* leaves.

#### Inducible expression of c-myc-NbMKK1 and GFP-NbMKK1

A DNA sequence corresponding to the triple c-myc tag (EFGEQKLISEEDLNGEQKLISEEDLNGEQKLISEEDLNGKL) was added onto the 5'-end of the open reading frame (ORF) of NbMKK1 by PCR, resulting in c-myc-NbMKK1 cDNA. This fragment was cloned into the Xhol and Spel sites of the GVG-vector pTA7001 (Aoyama and Chua, 1997). Engineered GFP gene (mGFP; Haseloff and Amos, 1995) was fused to the 5'-end of NbMKK1 cDNA, resulting in GFP-NbMKK1 and was cloned into pTA7001. These binary vectors were used for transformation of A. tumefaciens GV3101. N. benthamiana leaves were infiltrated with A. tumefaciens cells to establish transient transformation. Two days after A. tumefaciens infiltration, DEX (30 µm in 0.1% ethanol) was infiltrated to induce transgene expression. NbMKK1KR, a kinase-dead mutant of NbMKK, was generated by changing the nucleotides so that the conserved Lys88 residue was substituted by Arg. The mutant was generated following a procedure described previously (Yang et al., 2001).

# Measurement of $H_2O_2$

 $H_2O_2$  generation was measured by using dichlorofluorescin diacetate (DCFH-DA) as described by Sanchez *et al.* (1990).

#### Protoplast preparation for the visualization of GFP-NbMKK1

Agrobacterium tumefaciens cells containing GFP-NbMKK1 vector were infiltrated into *N. benthamiana* leaves by a needleless syringe. Protoplasts were isolated 12 h after DEX treatment, by treating the leaf samples with a mixture of 1.4% cellulase Onozuka R-10 (Yakult, http://www.yakult.co.jp) and 0.4% macerozyme R-10 (Yakult).

# Preparation of recombinant proteins and in vitro phosphorylation assay

An enterokinase site was introduced in both the 5'- and 3'-ends of the ORF of NbMKK1, NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> or NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> by PCR, and these were cloned in frame into the pET-46 Ek/LIC vector<sup>™</sup> (Novagen, http://splash.emdbiosciences.com/). Escherichia coli cells (Origami  $B^{TM}$ [DE3]) were transformed with pET-46 Ek/LIC constructs, and protein production was induced with 0.5 mm IPTG at 25°C for 8 h. His-tagged proteins were purified using the MagneHis<sup>™</sup> protein purification system (Promega, http://www.promega.com/), and desalted using Dialyzer<sup>™</sup> (Spectrum, http://www.spectrapor.com/). An autophosphorylation assay was performed by incubating 0.5 µg of purified recombinant NbMKK1 or NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> in reaction buffer (25 mм Tris-HCl, pH 7.5, 10 mм MnCl<sub>2</sub>, 1 mм EGTA and 1 mм DTT) in the presence of 25  $\mu M$  [ $\gamma \text{-}^{32}\text{P}]\text{ATP}$  at 30°C for 30 min. The reaction was stopped by the addition of SDS loading buffer, and kinase activity was detected by autoradiography following SDS-PAGE. The phosphorylation activity of NbMKK1s was determined by using the inactive mutant  $NbSIPK^{KR}$  (1  $\mu g)$  as a substrate under the same conditions as the autophosphorylation assay, except that 0.1  $\mu$ g of either NbMKK1 or NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> was used in the reaction.

#### Protein kinase assay

The in-gel kinase assay was performed as described by Takahashi *et al.* (2003a).

#### Yeast two-hybrid assay

A cDNA fragment corresponding to the NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> was cloned into pGBKT7 (Clontech, http://www.clontech.com/) resulting in pGBKT7-NbSIPK<sup>KR</sup> (bait vector). A cDNA for NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> was cloned into pGADT7 (Clontech) resulting in pGADT7-NbMKK1<sup>KR</sup> (prey vector). These two plasmids were co-transformed into a yeast strain AH109, and the transformed yeast cells streaked on selective agar plates containing minimal medium without Leu, Trp, His and Ade supplemented with 10 mm 3-amino-1,2,3-triazole (3-AT) and 40 mg l<sup>-1</sup> X- $\alpha$ -gal.

#### Southern analysis

Genomic DNA (10  $\mu$ g) of *N. benthamiana* isolated with DNeasy Plant Mini Kit (Qiagen, http://www1.qiagen.com/) was digested with restriction endonuclease *Hind*III and *Xbal*, respectively, and loaded on 0.8% agarose gel for electrophoresis. The separated DNA fragments were blotted onto nylon membrane (Hybond N+; Amersham) and hybridized with a <sup>32</sup>P-labeled complementary DNA fragment corresponding to the nucleotide positions 21–390 of the *NbMKK1* gene.

#### VIGS in N. benthamiana

A cDNA fragment corresponding to the nucleotide positions 21–390 of *NbMKK1*, whereby the first nucleotide of the first codon was set to position one, was cloned into the PVX vector pPC2S (Baulcombe *et al.*, 1995) in an anti-sense orientation resulting in pTXS.*NbMKK1*. pTXS.*NbMKK1* was linearized with the restriction endonuclease *Spel*, and *in vitro* run-off transcripts were synthesized by T7 RNA polymerase. The transcripts were inoculated to *N. benthamiana* plants as described elsewhere (Saitoh *et al.*, 2001). Confirmation of the gene silencing of *NbMKK1* was made by RT-PCR using the primer pair 5'-CGCAACAAAATCCAAACG-3' and 5'-AGTCGAGT CCGCTAAGTA-3'. *NbSIPK* and *NbWIPK* gene silencing was performed as described previously (Sharma *et al.*, 2003).

#### INF1 treatment and inoculation of P. cichorii

INF1 elicitor (100 nm) was prepared according to Kamoun *et al.* (1998) and infiltrated to well-developed leaf blades. *P. cichorii* SPC9001 (Hikichi *et al.*, 1998) was grown at 28°C in nutrient broth medium (Difco, http://www.vgdusa.com/DIFCO.htm) containing ampicillin (10  $\mu$ g ml<sup>-1</sup>) overnight. After centrifugation, bacterial cells were resuspended in 10 mm MgCl<sub>2</sub> (OD<sub>600</sub> = 0.01). Bacterial suspensions were infiltrated into leaves using a needleless syringe. The increase in the numbers of bacteria was estimated in leaf discs. Further details are available in Sharma *et al.* (2003).

#### Acknowledgements

We acknowledge Mattieu Joosten, Wageningen University, for the provision of pSfinx vector; David Baulcombe, Sainsbury Laboratory, John Innes Center for pPC2S; Nam Hai Chua, Rockefeller University for pTA7001 and Jim Haseloff, Cambridge University, for mGFP. YT was supported by a Research Fellowship of Japan Society for the Promotion of Science for young scientists. This work was carried out in part by support from 'Program for Promotion of Basic Research Activities for Innovative Biosciences' (Japan) and by 'Iwate University 21st Century COE Program: Establishment of Thermo-Biosystem Research Program' to RT. Thanks are due to Thomas Berberich, Bert Coemans and Matt Shenton for improving the manuscript. This work was carried out in a containment facility of Iwate Biotechnology Research Center under License No. 13-YokoShoku-965 from the Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries, Japan, and License No. 12-Ken-Kyoku-52 from the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science, Japan.

#### References

- Ahlfors, R., Macioszek, V., Rudd, J., Brosché, M., Schlichting, R., Scheel, D. and KangasJärvi, J. (2004) Stress hormone-independent activation and nuclear translocation of mitogen-activated protein kinases in *Arabidopsis thaliana* during ozone exposure. *Plant J.* 40, 512–522.
- Aoyama, T. and Chua, N.-H. (1997) A glucocorticoid-mediated transcriptional induction system in transgenic plants. *Plant J.* 11, 605–612.
- Asai, T., Tena, G., Plotnikova, J., Willmann, M.R., Chiu, W.-L., Gomez-Gomez, L., Boller, T., Ausubel, F.M. and Sheen, J. (2002) MAP kinase signalling cascade in *Arabidopsis* innate immunity. *Nature*, **415**, 977–983.
- Austin, M.J., Muskett, P., Kahn, F., Feys, B.J., Jones, J.D. and Parker, J.E. (2002) Regulatory role of SGT1 in early R genemediated plant defenses. *Science*, **295**, 2077–2080.
- Azevedo, C., Sadanandom, A., Kitagawa, K., Freialdenhoven, A., Shirasu, K. and Schulze-Lefert, P. (2002) The RAR1 interactor SGT1, an essential component of R gene-triggered disease resistance. *Science*, **295**, 2073–2076.
- Baker, B., Zambryski, P., Staskawicz, B. and Dinesh-Kumar, S.P. (1997) Signaling in plant–microbe interactions. *Science*, 276, 726– 733.
- Baulcombe, D.C., Chapman, S. and Santa Cruz, S. (1995) Jellyfish green fluorescent protein as a reporter for virus infections. *Plant J.* 7, 1045–1053.
- Beers, E.P. and McDowell, J.M. (2001) Regulation and execution of programmed cell death in response to pathogens, stress and developmental cues. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 4, 561–567.
- Bögre, L., Calderini, O., Binarova, P. et al. (1999) A MAP kinase is activated late in plant mitosis and becomes localized to the plane of cell division. *Plant Cell*, **11**, 101–113.
- Calderini, O., Bögre, L., Vicente, O., Binarova, P., Heberle-Bors, E. and Wilson, C. (1998) A cell cycle regulated MAP kinase with a possible role in cytokinesis in tobacco cells. J. Cell Sci. 11, 3091–3100.
- Calderini, O., Glab, N., Bergounioux, C., Heberle-Bors, E. and Wilson, C. (2001) A novel tobacco mitogen-activated protein (MAP) kinase kinase, NtMEK1, activates the cell cycle-regulated p43Nt6 MAP kinase. J. Biol. Chem. 276, 18139–18145.
- Cardinale, F., Meskiene, I., Ouaked, F. and Hirt, H. (2002) Convergence and divergence of stress-induced mitogen-activated protein kinase signaling pathways at the level of two distinct mitogen-activated protein kinase kinases. *Plant Cell*, **14**, 703–711.
- Century, K.S., Holub, E.B. and Staskawicz, B.J. (1995) NDR1, a locus of Arabidopsis thaliana that is required for disease resistance to both a bacterial and a fungal pathogen. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 92, 6597–6601.
- Chen, R.H., Sarnecki, C. and Blenis, J. (1992) Nuclear localization and regulation of erk- and rsk-encoded protein kinases. *Mol. Cell. Biol.* 12, 915–927.

- Cyert, M.S. (2001) Regulation of nuclear localization during signaling. J. Biol. Chem. 276, 20805–20808.
- Dangl, J.L. and Jones, J.D.G. (2001) Plant pathogens and integrated defense responses to infection. *Nature*, 411, 826–833.
- Davis, R.J. (2000) Signal transduction by the JNK group of MAP kinases. Cell, 103, 239–252.
- Ferrigno, P., Posas, F., koepp, D., Saito, H. and Silver, P.A. (1998) Regulated nucleo/cytoplasmic exchange of HOG1 MAPK requires the importin β homologs NMD5 and XPO1. *EMBO J.* **17**, 5606– 5614.
- Fukuda, M., Gotoh, I., Adachi, M., Gotoh, Y. and Nishida, E. (1997) A novel regulatory mechanism in the mitogen-activated protein (MAP) kinase cascade. Role of nuclear export signal of MAP kinase kinase. J. Biol. Chem. 272, 32642–32648.
- Greenberg, J.T. (1997) Programmed cell death in plant–pathogen interactions. Annu. Rev. Plant Physiol. Plant Mol. Biol. 48, 525–545.
- Hammond-Kosack, K.E. and Jones, J.D.G. (1996) Resistance genedependent plant defense responses. *Plant Cell*, 8, 1773–1791.
- Haseloff, J. and Amos, B. (1995) GFP in plant. *Trends Genet.* **11**, 328–329.
- Herskowitz, I. (1995) MAP kinase pathways in yeast: for mating and more. *Cell*, **80**, 187–197.
- Hikichi, Y., Suzuki, T., Toyoda, K., Horikochi, M., Hirooka, T. and Okuno, T. (1998) Successive observation of growth and movement of genetically lux-marked *Pseudomonas cichorii* and the response of host tissues in the same lettuce leav. *Ann. Phytopathol. Soc. Jpn*, 64, 519–525.
- Hoyos, M.E. and Zhang, S. (2000) Calcium-independent activation of salicylic acid-induced protein kinase and a 40-kilodalton protein kinase by hyperosmotic stress. *Plant Physiol.* **122**, 1355–1363.
- Hubert, D.A., Tornero, P., Belhadir, Y., Krishna, P., Takahashi, A., Shirasu, K. and Dangl, J.L. (2003) Cytosolic HSP90 associates with and modulates the Arabidopsis RPM1 disease resistance protein. *EMBO J.* 22, 5679–5689.
- Ichimura, K., Shinozaki, K., Tena, G. et al. (2002) Mitogen-activated protein kinase cascades in plants: a new nomenclature. *Trends Plant Sci.* 7, 301–308.
- Jaaro, H., Rubinfeld, H., Hanoch, T. and Seger, R. (1997) Nuclear translocation of mitogen-activated protein kinase kinase (MEK1) in response to mitogenic stimulation. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, 94, 3742–3747.
- Jin, H., Liu, Y., Yang, K.-Y., Kim, C.Y., Baker, B. and Zhang, S. (2003) Function of a mitogen-activated protein kinase pathway in Ngene mediated resistance in tobacco. *Plant J.* 33, 719–731.
- Kamoun, S., van West, P., Vleeshouwers, V.G., de Groot, K.E. and Govers, F. (1998) Resistance of *Nicotiana Benthamiana* to *Phyt-ophthora infestans* is mediated by the recognition of the elicitor protein INF1. *Plant Cell*, **10**, 1413–1426.
- Kondoh, K., Torii, S. and Nishida, E. (2005) Control of MAP kinase signalling to the nucleus. *Chromosoma*, **114**, 86–91.
- Lam, E., Kato, N. and Lawton, M. (2001) Programmed cell death, mitochondria and the plant hypersensitive response. *Nature*, 411, 848–853.
- Lee, J., Klessig, D.F. and Nürnberger, T. (2001) A harpin binding site in tobacco plasma membranes mediates activation of the pathogenesis-related gene *HIN1* independent of extracellular calcium but dependent on mitogen-activated protein kinase activity. *Plant Cell*, 13, 1079–1093.
- Lee, J., Rudd, J.J., Macioszek, V.K. and Scheel, D. (2004) Dynamic changes in the localization of MAP kinase cascade components controlling *pathogenesis-related* (*PR*) gene expression during innate immunity in parsley. J. Biol. Chem. 279, 22440–22448.
- Lenormand, P., Brondello, J.M., Brunet, A. and Pouyssegur, J. (1998) Growth factor-induced p42/p44 MAPK nuclear transloca-

tion and retention requires both MAPK activation and neosynthesis of nuclear anchoring proteins. J. Cell Biol. **142**, 625–633.

- Ligterink, W., Kroj, T., zur Nieden, U., Hirt, H. and Scheel, D. (1997) Receptor-mediated activation of a MAP kinase in pathogen defense of plants. *Science*, 276, 2054–2057.
- Liu, Y., Schiff, M., Marathe, R. and Dinesh-Kumar, S.P. (2002a) Tobacco Rar1, EDS1 and NPR/NIM1 like genes are required for N-mediated resistance to tabacco mosaic virus. Plant J. 30, 415– 429.
- Liu, Y., Schiff, M., Serino, G., Deng, X.-W. and Dinesh-Kumar, S.P. (2002b) Role of SCF ubiquitin-ligase and the COP9 signalosome in the *N* gene-mediated resistance response to tobacco mosaic virus. *Plant Cell*, **14**, 1483–1496.
- Liu, Y., Burch-Smith, T., Schiff, M., Feng, S. and Dinesh-Kumar, S.P. (2004a) Molecular chaperone Hsp90 associates with resistance protein N and its signaling proteins SGT1 and Rar1 to modulate an innate immune response in plants. *J. Biol. Chem.* 279, 2101– 2108.
- Liu, Y., Schiff, M. and Dinesh-Kumar, S.P. (2004b) Involvement of MEK1 MAPKK, NTF6 MAPK, WRKY/MYB transcription factors, COI1 and CTR1 in N-mediated resistance to tobacco mosaic virus. *Plant J.* 38, 800–809.
- Lu, R., Malcuit, I., Moffett, P., Ruiz, M.T., Peart, J., Wu, A.J., Rathjen, J.P., Bendahmane, A., Day, L. and Baulcombe, D.C. (2004) High throughput virus-induced gene silencing implicates heat shock protein 90 in plant disease resistance. *EMBO J.* 22, 5690–5699.
- Martin, G.B. (1999) Functional analysis of plant disease resistance genes and their downstream effectors. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 2, 273–279.
- Mikolajczyk, M., Awotunde, O.S., Muszynska, G., Klessig, D.F. and Do-browolska, G. (2000) Osmotic stress induces rapid activation of a salicylic acid-induced protein kinase and a homolog of protein kinase ASK1 in tobacco cells. *Plant Cell*, 12, 165–178.
- Nasir, K.H.B., Takahashi, Y., Ito, A. et al. (2005) High-throughput in planta expression screening identifies a class II ethyleneresponsive element binding factor-like protein that regulates plant cell death and non-host resistance. Plant J. 43, 491–505.
- Parker, J.E., Holub, E.B., Frost, L.N., Falk, A., Gunn, N.D. and Daniels, M.J. (1996) Characterization of eds1, a mutation in Arabidopsis suppressing resistance to Peronospora parasitica specified by several different RPP genes. Plant Cell, 8, 2033– 2046.
- Peart, J.R., Lu, R., Sadanandom, A. et al. (2002) Ubiquitin ligaseassociated protein SGT1 is required for host and nonhost disease resistance in plants. Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA, 99, 10865–10869.
- Pedley, K.F. and Martin, G.B. (2004) Identification of MAPKs and their possible MAPK kinase activators involved in the Pto-mediated defense response of tomato. J. Biol. Chem. 279, 49229– 49235.
- Pedley, K.F. and Martin, G.B. (2005) Role of mitogen-activated protein kinases in plant immunity. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* 8, 541– 547.
- Pouyssegur, J., Volmat, V. and Lenormand, P. (2002) Fidelity and spatiotemporal control in MAP kinase (ERKs) signalling. *Biochem. Pharmacol.* 64, 755–763.
- del Pozo, O., Pedley, K.F. and Martin, G.B. (2004) MAPKKKα is a positive regulator of cell death associated with both plant immunity and disease. *EMBO J.* 23, 3072–3082.
- Quimby, B.B., Wilson, C.A. and Corbett, A.H. (2000) The interaction between Ran and NTF2 is required for cell cycle progression. *Mol. Biol. Cell*, **11**, 2617–2629.

- Raviv, Z., Kalie, E. and Seger, R. (2004) MEK5 and ERK5 are localized in the nuclei of resting as well as stimulated cells, while MEKK2 translocates from the cytosol to the nucleus upon stimulation. *J. Cell Sci.* **117**, 1773–1784.
- Ren, D., Yang, H. and Zhang, S. (2002) Cell death mediated by mitogen-activated protein kinase pathway is associated with the generation of hydrogen peroxide in *Arabidopsis. J. Biol. Chem.* 277, 559–565.
- Romeis, T. (2001) Protein kinases in the plant defence response. *Curr. Opin. Plant Biol.* **4**, 407–414.
- Romeis, T., Piedras, P., Zhang, S., Klessig, D.F., Hirt, H. and Jones, J.D.G. (1999) Rapid Avr9- and Cf9-dependent activation of MAP kinases in tobacco cell cultures and leaves: convergence of resistance gene, elicitor, wound, and salicylate responses. *Plant Cell*, **11**, 273–287.
- Romeis, T., Ludwig, A.A., Martin, R. and Jones, J.D.G. (2001) Calcium-dependent protein kinases play an essential role in a plant defence response. *EMBO J.* 20, 5556–5567.
- Saitoh, H., Kiba, A., Nishihara, M., Yamamura, S., Suzuki, K. and Terauchi, R. (2001) Production of antimicrobial defensin in *Nic-otiana benthamiana* with a potato virus X vector. *Mol. Plant Microbe Interact.* 14, 111–115.
- Sanchez, F.A., Santema, J.S., Hilhorst, R. and Visser, A.J. (1990) Fluorescence detection of enzymatically formed hydrogen peroxide in aqueous solution and in reversed micelles. *Anal. Biochem.* 187, 129–132.
- Seo, S., Okamoto, M., Seto, H., Ishizuka, K., Sano, H. and Ohashi, Y. (1995) Tobacco MAP kinase: a possible mediator in wound signal transduction pathways. *Science*, **270**, 1988–1992.
- Seo, S., Sano, H. and Ohashi, Y. (1999) Jasmonate-based wound signal transduction requires activation of WIPK, a tobacco mitogen-activated protein kinase. *Plant Cell*, **11**, 289–298.
- Sharma, P.C., Ito, A., Shimizu, T., Terauchi, R., Kamoun, S. and Saitoh, H. (2003) Virus-induced silencing of WIPK and SIPK genes reduces resistance to a bacterial pathogen, but has no effect on the INF-induced hypersensitive response (HR) in Nicotiana benthamiana. Mol. Genet. Genomics, 269, 583–591.
- Shirasu, K., Lahaye, T., Tan, M.W., Zhou, F., Azevedo, C. and Schulze-Lefert, P. (1999) A novel class of eukaryotic zinc-binding proteins is required for disease resistance signaling in barley and development in *C. elegans. Cell*, 99, 355–366.
- Takahashi, Y., Berberich, T., Miyazaki, A., Seo, S., Ohashi, Y. and Kusatno, T. (2003a) Spermine signaling in tobacco: activation of mitogen-activated protein kinases by spermine is mediated through mitochondrial dysfunction. *Plant J.* 36, 820–829.
- Takahashi, A., Casais, C., Ichimura, K. and Shirasu, K. (2003b) HSP90 interacts with RAR1 and SGT1 and is essential for RPS2-mediated disease resistance in Arabidopsis. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, 100, 11777–11782.
- Takken, F.L.W., Luderer, R., Gabriëls, S.H.E.J., Westerink, N., Lu, R., de Wit, P.J.G.M. and Joosten, M.H.A.J. (2000) A functional cloning strategy, based on a binary PVX-expression vector, to isolate HR-inducing cDNAs of plant pathogens. *Plant J.* 24, 275–283.
- Tanoue, T., Moriguchi, T. and Nishida, E. (1999) Molecular cloning and characterization of a novel dual specificity phosphatase, MKP-5. J. Biol. Chem. 274, 19949–19956.
- Tanoue, T., Adachi, M., Moriguchi, T. and Nishida, E. (2000) A conserved docking motif in MAP kinases common to substrates, activators and regulators. *Nat. Cell Biol.* 2, 110–116.
- Widmann, C., Gibson, S., Jarpe, M.B. and Johnson, G.L. (1999) Mitogen-activated protein kinase: conservation of a three-kinase module from yeast to human. *Physiol. Rev.* **79**, 143–180.

© 2006 The Authors

Journal compilation © 2007 Blackwell Publishing Ltd, The Plant Journal, (2007), 49, 1030–1040

Yang, K.-Y., Liu, Y. and Zhang, S. (2001) Activation of a mitogenactivated protein kinase pathway is involved in disease resistance in tobacco. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, 98, 741–746.

Zhang, S. and Klessig, D.F. (1997) Salicylic acid activates a 48 kD MAP kinase in tobacco. *Plant Cell*, **9**, 809–824.

Zhang, S. and Klessig, D.F. (1998) *N* resistance gene-mediated *de novo* synthesis and activation of a tobacco MAP kinase by TMV infection. *Proc. Natl Acad. Sci. USA*, **95**, 7433–7438.

GenBank Accession Number of NbMKK1: AB243987

- Zhang, S. and Klessig, D.F. (2001) MAPK cascades in plant defense signaling. *Trends Plant Sci.* **6**, 520–527.
- Zhang, S. and Liu, Y. (2001) Activation of salicylic acid-induced protein kinase, a mitogen-activated protein kinase, induces multiple defense responses in tobacco. *Plant Cell*, **13**, 1877– 1889.